

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: Josh Engel

Date of review: 18 July 2017

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-E(audio recording)

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

The combination of the recording, however brief, and Andy's description of the bird's behavior and description of the call are enough evidence to vote to accept this record.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: Fraker

Date of review: 7/25/17

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

I am still uncomfortable making this call on a single faint though matching call note versus a longer recording demonstrating that it was repeating.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: Walter Marcisz

Date of review: 7-23-17

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-E (audio)

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

I voted to accept during the last circulation, but three other committee members voted against acceptance. To my way of thinking, the most serious criticism came from Doug Stotz. Although he was not able to hear the Gilbert recordings on his computer, Stotz commented that the single call sonogram signal accompanying Gilbert's ebird recording does not look like the sonogram of Townsend's Solitaires he found on the internet, which have a strong pulse right at the start and then trail off on the same pitch. Stotz further commented that the note recorded by Gilbert seems to go down a little and really lacks a strong opening pulse, but the pitch looks to be about right.

This comment certainly gave me pause – if the sonograms don't match, that sounds like a deal-breaker to me. So I went back to xeno-canto to listen to TOSO call note recordings and look at the accompanying sonograms. I found quite a lot of variation in the appearance of the sonograms, some matching Doug's description. But I eventually found a TOSO call note recording made by Alex Rinkert. In my estimation, not only does Rinkert's sonogram look like Gilbert's sonogram, but I was actually able to play both Rinkert's recording and Gilbert's recordings at the same time on my computer. To my ears, Rinkert's recording is virtually identical to Gilbert's first ebird recording. The number of Rinkert's xeno-canto recording is XC309801. Following Geoff Williamson's recommendation, I also went back and listened to recording XC158511 on xeno-canto by Ian Cruickshank, and I agree that the tone and pitch a good match for 2016-091. I will say that Cruickshank's recording seems to have been recorded at a higher volume than Gilbert's, and the sonograms do not match up very well. Not so with Rinkert's recording, which I believe is a good match for Gilbert's recording both in terms of the actual sound and the appearance of the sonogram.

Based on the above, I stand by my original comments from the last circulation, and I again vote to accept.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: McMullen

Date of review: 7-4-17

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-E (audio)

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

Weak recording or not, the call note IS that of a Townsend's Solitaire. There should be no debate. That's a very distinct call that most of us have heard in Illinois!

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: Douglas Stotz

Date of review: 25 July 2017

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-E(audio)

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation] My hearing has improved enough that I can hear the call this time. There are things I would like to make me happier about the record, like several iterations of the note, but I think the call is sufficient, and Andy Gilbert's documentation is pretty convincing.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: Paul Sweet

Date of review: 7/6/2017

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-E(audio)

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation] I pulled a couple of audio files from xeno-canto, and found a similar pattern to the call in the audio. The initial drop in frequency is in fact visible in the 3 calls I looked at from xeno-canto.org. The frequency range is just about right, and the length of the calls is very close. The recording in question is fainter than the ones off of xeno-canto, and some of the apparent difference in the sonograms appears to be an artifact of the volume.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2016-091

Name of bird form: Townsend's Solitaire

Committee member name: Geoffrey A. Williamson

Date of review: 1 July 2017

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-E(audio)

Comments: [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

This is another tough one. I still think that the spectrogram looks okay for Townsend's Solitaire. Certainly it would be good to have additional or louder recordings.