

## IORC EVALUATION FORM

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** Josh Engel

**Date of review:** 15 June 2016

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** A-E(photo)

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

The hesitation among the committee members revolved around two factors:

- 1) The wing pattern—in particular the classic Slaty-backed “string of pearls” was not seen, and
- 2) Herring x Great Black-backed Gull was not adequately eliminated

These are valid issues. However, I still believe that the shape of the bird looks spot-on for Slaty-backed, and the dark smudge around the eye is a good mark for Slaty-backed. I am keeping my vote to accept. It might be good to get outside opinions, particularly given that the observer says that the photos were sent to other birders, including members of this committee and Amar Ayyash, and concludes that “all agreed that this gull was probably a Slaty-backed Gull...”

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** Fraker

**Date of review:** 7/10/16

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

The written description is excellent but I think with the craziness of large white-headed gull combos in this day and age an observer almost **MUST** have photos that establish the ID to back the written description up. As I commented for the first circulation, I agree it “probably” is a SBGU; I just think that it is imperative to have photos in hand that can help move from “probably” to “is” and I’m not sure that these do.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** Greg Lambeth

**Date of review:** July 7, 2016

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** U – I

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

I initially voted to accept this record, but three committee members independently raised the possibility of a Herring and Great-black backed hybrid. This raises a sufficient amount of uncertainty to lead me to change my vote.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** McMullen

**Date of review:** 6-23-16

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** A-E (photo)

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

I've changed my vote to accept based on the fact that the bird is described well, photos look good for Slaty-backed and as others mentioned, there was an influx of Slaty-backed in the Midwest this winter.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** Douglas Stotz

**Date of review:** 12 July 2016

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation] I think this is probably a Slaty-backed Gull, but guess that the lack of any detail on the wing pattern and the complete failure to consider hybrid possibilities lead me to vote against this record at this point.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** Paul Sweet

**Date of review:** 6/14/16

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

Reviewing the photos, the tertial crescents seem a bit small, but more importantly the bird overall seems quite large, relative to the Herring Gulls nearby. I agree with several commenters that HERG X GBBG can't be ruled out.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2016-013

**Name of bird form:** Slaty-backed Gull

**Committee member name:** Geoffrey A. Williamson

**Date of review:** 7 June 2016

**Circulation number:** 2nd

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a 2nd circulation]

Both Lesser Black-backed Gull and Great Black-backed Gull are adequately eliminated by the photographs and written description. I think also that Western Gull is also eliminated by these. I do not think Kelp Gull is a serious contender.

What else is there? Hybrids. Most worrisome is Herring X Great Black-backed. Is this hybrid combination eliminated? Engel feels that "the extensive head streaking, as well as the dark smudge around the eye noted in the description, help eliminate this hybrid combination." I am not as yet convinced that this is enough to exclude this hybrid combination as a possibility.