

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Fraker

Date of review: 08/01/19

Circulation number: 3rd [resubmission]

Vote: A-E(ph)/A-S

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation]

I respect the "hybrid" issue with this species. Based on the second photo, and the observer's attention to detail and experience, and the fact that he took 90 photos of this bird, I am comfortable accepting it.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Davida Kalina

Date of review: 16 July 2019

Circulation number: 3rd [resubmission]

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation]

I again vote to reject this record based on the fact that a female MALLxMODU hybrid cannot be ruled out, since the submitter was never able to observe the entire speculum.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Walter Marcisz

Date of review: 7-20-19

Circulation number: 3rd [resubmission]

Vote: A-E (photo)

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation]

To me, the main issue with this record is the blurriness and lack of clarity in the photos provided. I voted to reject during the 1st circulation but changed my vote to accept during the second pass for reasons previously stated.

During the previous circulation, Davida Kalina commented: "The written submission rules out a male MALL x MODU hybrid on the basis of lack of a curled center tail feather. But a female hybrid cannot be ruled out, since the submitter never observed the entire speculum." I have thought a lot about this comment, but my assumption has always been that 2013-065 is a male, based on the bright yellow bill. All of the sources I have checked indicate that bill color of both female Mottled Duck and Mallard ranges from olive-drab to orange, to black & orange, but never bright yellow as in males. To me, the bill color in Photo #2 looks bright yellow, not orange. Getting back to the poor quality of the photos, it is at least possible the bill color has been misrepresented, but my best guess is that the bill is really yellow.

In the end, I would echo Doug Stotz's comments from the previous circulation: "I think the new photo along with Bohlen's additional discussion convinces me that this bird is truly a Mottled Duck and not a hybrid. It may be that hybrids are common enough that we'll never be sure about any Mottled Duck. This record seems like about as good as we can reasonably expect."

Again, I vote to accept.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Adam Sell

Date of review: 7/18/19

Circulation number: 3rd [resubmission]

Vote: A-S (1)

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation]

Reluctant to accept, but remembering the variation of individual MODU at FMNH, along with reviewing photos of pure Florida birds, I believe Bohlen has described Mottled Duck. I'm confident in his field experience. I can't get much from the photo, but Bohlen's written description is sufficient.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Douglas Stotz

Date of review: 27 July 2019

Vote: A-E(photo)

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation]

I have always been hesitant about accepting Mottled Duck records, and perhaps moreso in the recent past with more evidence of hybridization between Mottled Ducks and Mallards. However, based on what I currently know and the material provided for this record, I am comfortable accepting it as a Mottled Duck.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Paul Sweet

Date of review: 7/13/19

Circulation number: 3rd [resubmission]

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation] I'm still concerned about the possibility of a hybrid – the increase in observations here in Illinois seems to coincide with two trends that might be related. One is the increase in Black-bellied Whistling Ducks – that suggests a general movement of southern ducks coming north. The other is the increases in hybrids in central Florida, which suggests that the Mottled Ducks showing up here may be largely hybrids with migratory tendencies inherited from Mallards.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Geoffrey A. Williamson

Date of review: 4 July 2019

Circulation number: 3rd [resubmission]

Vote: A-S(1)

Comments: [required as this is a 3rd circulation]

This complex is difficult.

I don't have anything to add to my earlier comments. I think this record is okay. Though the photos are not enough on their own to eliminate hybrids as a possibility, the observer looked for signs of hybridization and didn't find any.