

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Fraker

Date of review: 9/30/18

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: A-S/E(ph)

Comments:

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Walter Marcisz

Date of review: 10-19-18

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: U-I

Comments:

Prior to the present circulation of records, I had not read the Leukering/Pranty article "Mottled Duck Hybridization" (eBird, 2015). When I finally read through it, I found it was an eye-opener, to say the least. In the "Quiz time" section, the question is asked: "How many Mottled Ducks are present in Figures 3-12?" I glossed over the photos quickly, and in my ignorance I assumed that about half of the birds pictured were "pure" Mottled Ducks. Of course I was wrong, in actuality all of the birds pictured in Figures 3-12 are Mallard X Mottled Duck hybrids. Characteristics to look for in hybrids include heavy cheek streaking, a very long dark eyeline, a reduced gape spot, paleness in the tail, a reddish or chestnut wash on the breast (males), and slightly curved central rectrices (males).

Based on the above, I am able to see a couple of red flags with record # 2013-065. First of all, the photos are far too blurry to make any assessment of the amount of cheek streaking. Secondly, Bohlen specifically mentions that the bird only had a small amount of black at the gape (a characteristic which could suggest possible hybridization). Based on the information provided, I am not confident that Mallard X Mottled Duck has been eliminated as a possibility, so I am voting to reject.

Literature Cited

Leukering, T and B Pranty (2015). Mottled Duck Hybridization. eBird.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: McMullen

Date of review: 10-19-18

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: A-S

Comments:

I concur, photos are blurry, but, at least there is a photo! No one in Illinois has more field experience than Bohlen, so his brief description and poor photo still equate to a positive ID. I'm aware of hybrids, as is the observer, and I'm certain he studied the bird at length to eliminate that possibility.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Adam Sell

Date of review: 9/30/18

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: U-I

Comments: The new photo is more clear, but still not enough to rule out a hybrid with mallard or mexican duck. While reviewing photos and some literature of the hybrids coming out of Florida, I hesitate to accept a Mottled Duck without clearer photos and a description that rules out all aspects of hybridization.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Douglas Stotz

Date of review: 5 November 2018

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: A-E(photo)

Comments: The second photo helps a lot. I would still like to see more detailed documentation. The hybrid issues with Mottled Duck x Mallard are really not dealt with.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Paul Sweet

Date of review: 10/28/18

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: U-I

Comments: Although the observer is clearly aware of the hybridization issues, I fear that the reference is somewhat dated by this point. The introduction of Mallards into central Florida in conjunction with theme parks in Orlando has created many more hybrid birds than Stutzenbaker seems to suggest, with several generations of hybrids likely. Knowing something about the likely origins of these Mottled-type birds showing up in the Midwest would help – if they're birds from Louisiana or Texas, I'd be much more comfortable with them. If they're from Florida, then I'd worry that we're seeing hybrids with migratory tendencies bred into them.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2013-065

Name of bird form: Mottled Duck

Committee member name: Geoffrey A. Williamson

Date of review: 14 September 2018

Circulation number: 1st circulation [resubmission]

Vote: A-E(photo)

Comments:

In the original series of votes, I went A-S(1), U-I, U-I. Now with the addition of the new photo, I am moving to A-E(photo). I think that the photo makes this clear that it is a Mottled Duck or a Mottled Duck hybridized with something that is enough like Mottled Duck so that no indications of hybridization show up in the photo. Bohlen's written summary explains that he looked for indications of hybridization at the time of the observation and found none.