

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2012.049

**Name of bird form:** Cave Swallow

**Committee member name:** Josh Engel

**Date of review:** 10 Nov 2015

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** While these birds were likely Cave Swallows, I don't think the description is adequate to eliminate Cliff Swallow. The main feature that the observer uses to ID the birds as Cave is the relatively pale throat, but I don't think this feature alone is enough to clinch the ID.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2012.049

**Name of bird form:** Cave Swallow

**Committee member name:** Dan Kassebaum

**Date of review:** 16 November 2015

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S

**Comments:**

Given the date the expected time this far north and more likely than Cliff Swallow

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2012.049

**Name of bird form:** Cave Swallow

**Committee member name:** Greg Lambeth

**Date of review:** November 29, 2015

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A - E

**Comments:**

This record poses a dilemma because it's a single observer sighting and does not include all field marks necessary to separate Cliff and Cave Swallow. The square tail and white streaking on the back are consistent with both Cliff and Cave Swallow. The description of the throat is more consistent with Cave Swallow. The date of the observation (November 8<sup>th</sup>) is consistent with Cave Swallow.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2012.049

Name of bird form: Cave Swallow

Committee member name: McMullen

Date of review: 11-12-15

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments:

Observer admitted he couldn't see forehead well & therefore I believe to accept a good CAVE doc we need a photo or a perfect written description with all details checked. I'm not convinced this bird is a CAVE + not a very late cliff.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2012.049

**Name of bird form:** Cave Swallow

**Committee member name:** Douglas Stotz

**Date of review:** 25 November 2015

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S

**Comments:** This is not an ideal report, but I think we have had enough records now to establish the fact that a November bird of the Cliff/Cave complex is almost certain to be Cave. The fact that the description does not have anything in it that seems more suggestive of Cliff than Cave (even if the description doesn't clinch Cave) means that I will vote for it.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2012.049

**Name of bird form:** Cave Swallow

**Committee member name:** Paul Sweet

**Date of review:** 11/9/15

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S(1)

**Comments:** The timing fits other sightings of this species, and the description does rule out other species of swallows.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 2012.049

**Name of bird form:** Cave Swallow

**Committee member name:** Geoffrey A. Williamson

**Date of review:** 8 November 2015

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S(1)

**Comments:**

I am persuaded by the description's including the squared-off tail with pale rump (narrowing things down to Cliff and Cave) and the pale, yellow-orange throat (which I feel effectively eliminates Cliff).