

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Fraker

Date of review: 9/30/18

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments:

Although I just voted to accept a record with almost the exact same documentation, the July timing of this record would be beyond exceptional. Both eastern Colorado and eastern Wyoming have single records representing the easternmost records for July.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Walter Marcisz

Date of review: 10-19-18

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments:

Another Cassin's Vireo documentation on the coattails of the acceptance of Illinois's first well-documented Cassin's Vireo and subsequent addition to the official state list.

This record also involves a singing bird, this time during the summer. Per the observer's comments, Sibley suggests the western 'race' of Blue-headed has a more burry song, and the possibility of a western Blue-headed probably can't be completely ruled out.

The out of season summer date makes me personally wonder if it could have been an extremely worn or off-plumage Yellow-throated Vireo. There is just a little too much doubt here for me. Again, I can't help but feel the need to exercise extreme caution with such a rare and difficult to identify species. I vote to reject, and least for this circulation.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: McMullen

Date of review: 10-19-18

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments:

Other vireos within the confusing complex of Blue-headed and Plumbeous should be more heavily considered.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Adam Sell

Date of review: 9/30/18

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments: Again, without photos, I don't seen enough of a description to rule out Plumbeous. When coupled with the time of year, I'm not sure a BHVI singing an aberrant song can be ruled out, either.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Douglas Stotz

Date of review: 16 November 2018

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments: I vote against this bird after having voted for 2000-083 because of the date in mid-July, which is not even commented upon by the observer, and the fact that everything feels like a less detailed repeat of the documentation done for the first bird. It just doesn't come through to me that this bird was thought about independently.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Paul Sweet

Date of review: 10/28/18

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments: When the documentation states that "Western Blue-headed can't be ruled out" it's very difficult to accept the record. There's also the issue that bird song is partially learned, which means that in cases like this there should be more plumage detail than is given here.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2002-052

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Geoffrey A. Williamson

Date of review: 18 September 2018

Circulation number: 1st

Vote: U-I

Comments:

An intriguing report. The July date makes an extralimital western bird more unusual than during migratory periods. Blue-headed Vireo is rare to stray south during summer but has precedent. Overall, the plumage details do not definitively eliminate Blue-headed from consideration. The identification is supported best by the vocalizations. In eliminating Blue-headed from consideration, the observer states, "The song quality plus the field marks described above eliminates Blue-headed Vireo." Which field marks? Everything description in section 6 of the documentation is consistent with that species in general nature. Perhaps because of the vocalizations, Cassin's would be a better fit, but because of its rarity, especially during July, I feel the possibility of an oddly singing Blue-headed hasn't been adequately eliminated. Single observer records without physical evidence are tough.