

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Fraker

Date of review: 3/30

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 2nd circulation] This is a very well-documented record but after our time with the Field Museum specimens I think a non-vocalizing autumn bird would have to be spectacularly documented.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Davida Kalina

Date of review: 15 April 2019

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 2nd circulation]

I feel the photos are not useful in distinguishing between Cassin's and Blue-headed Vireos—the overall yellow wash and various shading effects have created distortions. For example, I don't feel I can trust that there are no true differences in color intensity between the head and back, given that the bird appears to exhibit a dark, well-defined malar streak, an artifact from shade cast upon its face. Sunlight was clearly not striking the bird uniformly over its body.

The Birch article that Walter and Geoff referenced in the 1st circulation indicates there is noticeable overlap of features between bright Cassin's and dull Blue-headed Vireos.

Based on the extensive experience of the 2 submitters, I'm very hesitant to reject the record. But in considering how difficult it apparently is to tell bright CAVI and dull BHVI apart without hearing vocalizations, I'm not convinced by the written submissions of the ID as CAVI. I am voting to reject the record.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Walter Marcisz

Date of review: 4-19-19

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 2nd circulation]

I again vote to reject. After viewing numerous study skins of both Cassin's and Blue-headed Vireos at the FMNH during the last IORC meeting, I have much less confidence that dull individuals of Blue-headed Vireo can be conclusively separated from Cassin's Vireo in the field. Based on the study skins, it appears that these two forms can show a dizzying amount of overlap in virtually every respect, especially in dull individuals seen in the fall. As such, I would echo Doug Stotz's comment from the last circulation "I am not sure that a silent bird out of range can be certainly identified as a Cassin's Vireo."

In addition to the above, at the last IORC meeting, Geoff Williamson pointed out a quote from the Blue-headed Vireo entry in BNA online: "Individuals known to sing faithful renditions of Yellow-throated Vireo song ([Brewster 1903a](#), [Bent 1950](#))." This quote is rather sobering as it tends to even cast some doubt on the ID of singing Cassin's Vireos found out of range in the spring.

Literature cited:

Morton, E. S. and R. D. James (2014). Blue-headed Vireo (*Vireo solitarius*), version 2.0. In The Birds of North America (A. F. Poole, Editor). Cornell Lab of Ornithology, Ithaca, NY, USA. <https://doi.org/10.2173/bna.379>

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Adam Sell

Date of review: 4/23/19

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-S (2)

Comments: I'm struggling with this bird. The more I've poured over this individual I'm choosing to accept the record based upon the description and not the photo. This is a difficult species to identify without song or excellent photos. The next best thing would be to have two or more individuals with a lot of field experience who have a prolonged time with the bird. In this case, we have that. The description of the uniformity in color from the head/neck and back seems most in line with Cassin's, as is the supraloral in the photo, which is not well-defined to my eyes. I cannot get a read on the coloration of the back, and the break between the throat and the auriculars seems to be ill-defined, but not confident on that from one photo. Bohlen's description of the outer rectrix being white makes me pause, but not too much considering the overlap between the species. I think the combined field experience, plus the good description, is enough for a hesitant acceptance.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Douglas Stotz

Date of review: 27 May 2019

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 2nd circulation]

The photo is inadequate to establish the identity of this bird beyond it being part of the Solitary Vireo complex. Especially in the fall, the possibility of a dull Blue-headed Vireo has to be considered and carefully excluded. There are just too many pieces on this bird that are equivocal for its identity for me to accept this record.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Paul Sweet

Date of review: 6/22/19

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required as this is a 2nd circulation]

I voted to accept this the first time, but after looking over both the comments and some of the ID criteria, I've decided that there are enough discrepancies to make me uncomfortable voting to accept again. Notably, the description of bright white tertial edges and white outer webs to the outer rectrices both favor Blue-headed.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 2000-083

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Geoffrey A. Williamson

Date of review: 25 March 2019

Circulation number: 2nd

Vote: A-S(2)

Comments: [required as this is a 2nd circulation]

This record is tough. I am again voting in favor of accepting. One point that contributes to my willingness to accept is that both documenters stated strongly that there was no contrast between the head and the back. I find this hard to reconcile with identification as a Blue-headed. The photo seems supportive of this comment, despite its limitations.

I am having difficulty in understanding Stotz's comments about olive and gray on the back and head. I would think that a grayer back favors Cassin's over Blue-headed.

After looking at specimens, I have a better appreciation for how difficult an identification this is. I also spent a lot of time looking at photos online and going through my (limited number of) photographs. This was a sobering exercise. Still, the fact that this bird struck Dave Bohlen as not being a Blue-headed Vireo is significant.