

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Josh Engel

Date of review: 20 September 2017

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: A-E

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation]

I fully understand committee member's reservations about accepting this record, especially given the lack of physical evidence. However, I remain convinced by the details provided, and will continue to vote to accept.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Fraker

Date of review: 9/23/17

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: A(S)

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation]

I keep hopping the fence on this record. After reviewing our committee responses after the second circulation, I once again found my self leaning away from acceptance for a first state record on such a difficult ID issue.

But then I re-reviewed Paul's initial notes and the amount of effort he put into this ID for what I believe was "just" a subspecific ID at the time and that kept me on the "accept" side of the fence, along with the summary evidence of a faded presumed adult male (d/t singing) "Solitary" Vireo singing repeatedly and consistently a song reminiscent to several folks of a YTVI song.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Walter Marcisz

Date of review: 10-8-17

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: A-S (1)

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation]

I again vote to accept, as per my previous comments. A first state record of a difficult to identify species with no photo, but this is an extremely detailed description by an experienced, credible observer.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: McMullen

Date of review: 9-20-17

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation]

Like Geoff, I remain uncomfortable accepting this given that there is no physical evidence associated with the record. I, too, would prefer having both photographic and audio evidence, given that this is a potential first state record.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Douglas Stotz

Date of review: 9 October 2017

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: A-S(2)

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation] I still think the detailed description provided by Paul, especially with Bob Hughes confirming the basic outline of a dull Blue-headed Vireo that sounded like a Yellow-throated Vireo is sufficient for me to accept this record.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Paul Sweet

Date of review: 10/7/2017

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: A-S(1)

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation] There doesn't seem to be any new information, either in terms of documentation or comments, so I don't see any reason to change my vote.

IORC EVALUATION FORM

Record #: 1994-T-001

Name of bird form: Cassin's Vireo

Committee member name: Geoffrey A. Williamson

Date of review: 16 September 2017

Circulation number: 3rd

Vote: U-I

Comments: [required since this is a potential first state record and since this is a 3rd circulation]

This is a tough one. I am again voting not to accept, since I would like to have this backed up by physical evidence. Stotz noted in the 1st round that it was a different world in 1994, but Clyne was/is a forward-thinking individual, and he did make an attempt to get an audio recording. Probably more important was that in 1994, as a subspecies rather than a full species, this individual didn't command as much attention.