

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** Josh Engel

**Date of review:** 3/31/17

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

I always thought that birds could not be added to the state list without physical evidence. Regardless, I am voting to accept based on the description of the bird, including both plumage and voice. The observer obviously took great care to assess the identity of the bird and I am convinced that the identification is correct, despite the rarity of the taxon in Illinois and the difficult of identification.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** Fraker

**Date of review:** 3/7/17

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

This is one of those species that seems to me would almost require an audiotape or some sort of phot/vid documentation. Notes are excellent regardless; I just think that a 100% confirmation on an ID this difficult may need to come with hard in-hand evidence.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** Walter Marcisz

**Date of review:** 26 March 2017

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S (1)

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

I vote to approve. After reading Paul's extensive documentation, it is difficult for me to come up with a solid argument against the conclusion he came to. The most difficult and confounding aspect in distinguishing Blue-headed & Cassin's Vireo's is apparently the separation of immature birds (especially females) of both species, but the constant singing behavior of the bird strongly suggests that it was an adult male. Adult males of both species are relatively distinct given a good view (as in this case), and the bird consistently sang a burry "Cassin's-type" song. Just to play devil's advocate, I listened to several known identity Cassin's Vireo songs on xeno-canto. I found quite a bit of variation – some were fairly clear and similar to Blue-headed, but most were very burry, with some virtually indistinguishable from Yellow-throated Vireo (including the obligatory "three-eight" phrase), at least to my ears. Then I listened to about a dozen different Blue-headed Vireo songs on xeno-canto – all were sweet & clear with no burry quality. As a footnote, the usual caveats apply - interesting that even the December 1996 Birding Magazine article "Field Identification of the Solitary Vireo Complex" states that "some birds defy identification, even in the hand." But in this case, Paul's excellent documentation has pushed me over the edge – I believe the May 1994 bird was a Cassin's Vireo, and I vote to approve.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** McMullen

**Date of review:** 3-8-17

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

I'd be more apt to vote to accept if Hughes and Schullenberg would concur with this identification. Doesn't sound like that will ever happen.

Some of the details seem OK, but there are degrees of paleness in all the Blue-headed Vireos I've encountered.

## IORC EVALUATION FORM

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** Douglas Stotz

**Date of review:** 27 March 2017

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S(1)

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

A part of me thinks we shouldn't accept this record, given the amount of time that has passed. But that passage of time doesn't seem to be really Paul's fault, although I am puzzled what became of this documentation. Another part of me would like to see a photo or a recording, but the world was different in 1994. However, the description of what the bird looked like is good and the voice description fits as well. I have e-mailed Tom Schulenberg to see if he has any notes on the bird that might be relevant.

I have received a response from Tom. He has no recollection of seeing or hearing the bird, nor of suggesting the ID, and no notes regarding the observation. So there is no additional material available from Tom.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** Paul Sweet

**Date of review:** 3/8/17

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** A-S(1)

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

I was concerned about the use of the song as an ID feature, since there's nothing in the description that would rule out a Yellow-throated Vireo's song learned by mistake. However, there's also nothing that would rule out Cassin's by the song. The physical description seems to fit, though, especially the lack of gray on the nape. There are a couple of points that would have been nice to hear about, but the likelihood of a bird singing the wrong song also being this drab seems to be extremely low.

I do seem to recall reading about this bird in the Meadowlark, however.

## **IORC EVALUATION FORM**

**Record #:** 1994-T-001

**Name of bird form:** Cassin's Vireo

**Committee member name:** Geoffrey A. Williamson

**Date of review:** 4 March 2017

**Circulation number:** 1st

**Vote:** U-I

**Comments:** [required since this is a potential first state record]

The written documentation is good and makes a very plausible case that this was a Cassin's Vireo; however, without any physical evidence accompanying the record, I will not vote to accept since a nuanced identification problem is involved for a positive determination.