IORC # 1994.037

Paul Clyne
[redacted]

14 Dec 1994

Mr. Robert Chapel
[redacted]

Dear Bob,

I had not made it around to reviewing behavioral contrasts between Ash-throated and Great Crested Flycatcher before my last mailing. I've since found that published details corroborate nicely the identification of the 4 Sep 94 bird as an Ash-throated, and that the bird's behavior was atypical of Great Crested on exactly those points which make it typical of Ash-throated. I have accordingly prepared an addendum to the earlier documentation, enclosed herewith.

Since Dave Mandell was reticent to vouch for the identification to species, his initials should not be included in the citation of observers for this record.

Sincerely,

Paul R. Clyne

 IORC # 1994.057

ASH-THROATED FLYCATCHER AT JACKSON PARK, CHICAGO (COOK COUNTY), ILLINOIS, 4 SEPTEMBER 1994

On 4 Sep 1994, I studied an adult *Myiarchus* flycatcher on Wooded Island in Jackson Park, Chicago, which showed details consistent with, and apparently diagnostic of, Ash-throated Flycatcher *M. cinerascens*, and inconsistent with adult Great Crested Flycatcher *M. crinitus* or, apparently, any other *Myiarchus* flycatcher. This represents the second occurrence of *cinerascens* in Illinois, the first being an individual at Springfield from 2 Nov 1973, and collected on 9 Nov (Bohlen 1989). As far as I am aware, this is also only the second U.S. record east of the Mississippi from a non-coastal state. [1]

I first noted the bird in company with Shaibal Mitra at about 09:40 CDT inside the "Rose Garden" on Wooded Island (= Paul H. Douglas Nature Sanctuary, at about 6100 South), as it flew up from dense undergrowth to a perch roughly 15 feet above ground. My immediate gut reaction on seeing the bird was "flycatcher, not a Great Crested," and I suggested at that time that the bird was a candidate for *cinerascens*. Alas, the bird soon disappeared through the foliage. About 20 minutes later, Mitra relocated the bird, and I soon rejoined him. At this point the bird continued to perch mostly 15 feet above ground by a clearing circumscribed by 40 foot trees. It made a few flights to different perches, though was not actually noted flycatching. At one point Mitra observed it eating a berry of some sort from one of the fruiting trees. Over a period of about 15 minutes of sporadic views of the bird, we concluded that it was identifiably *cinerascens*, based on the plates in National Geographic Society 1987, coupled with extensive field experience with *crinitus* (including careful study of notably pale and out-of-season individuals). Significant details observed at this time included undertail pattern and bill color. Neither of us had had previous field experience with *cinerascens*. Observations were made using Bausch & Lomb 10 x 40 (Clyne) and Leica 8x42 (Mitra) binoculars. Skies were overcast, allowing optimal lighting without glare.

I returned to the site with David Mandell at about 11:20, armed with a Bushnell Discoverer spotting scope. After some effort we relocated the bird at a perch amid dense foliage just a few feet above ground. From there it moved to perches 15-20 feet above ground, and some excellent views were obtained of the bird on an exposed stump about 15 feet above ground. Bill color, bill proportions, mouth-lining color, and aspects of wing patterning and wear were among the details noted under the scope, set mostly at 20X magnification at a distance of roughly 40 feet. The undertail was not visible during these views.

At about 14:15, I returned to the site for a third time, now armed with the National Geographic field guide's tape recordings of *Myiarchus* flycatchers. I was soon joined by six other observers in search of the bird. I attempted to relocate it using playbacks of both *crinitus* and *cinerascens* calls and songs, but all attempts to find it at that time were in vain, and no *Myiarchus* flycatchers were located subsequently.

---

[1] Technically, the hypothetical Pennsylvania record of 22 Nov 89 qualifies as a record from a non-coastal state, but is disregarded here due to the site of occurrence in extreme southeastern Pennsylvania, just west of Wilmington, Delaware, and only about 40 km. (25 mi.) northeast of Chesapeake Bay. The record from Randall, Minnesota, is treated as a record from west of the Mississippi, though in the *Times Atlas of the World* Randall is plotted <u>on</u> the Mississippi. See further remarks at end of Appendix I.

DESCRIPTION: In brief, a *Myiarchus* flycatcher, appearing somewhat less robust and top-heavy than the standard of experience, *crinitus*. Upper mandible, black, paling slightly to gray towards the base. Lower mandible, black over its entire length. Bill, unsubstantial in size, with straight lower mandible and with upper mandible gently curved towards tip; superficially, the bill-tip appeared pointed, but was seen to be weakly hooked on close scrutiny. Mouth-lining of upper mandible (seen under scope when bird yawned), orangey flesh to fleshy pink (more pink than orange). Throat through upper breast, pale pearly gray. Mid-breast through undertail coverts, pale yellow. The demarcation between the gray upper breast and yellow underparts was well defined. Color and patterning of the underparts were similar to those shown for Dusky-capped Flycatcher (*M. tuberculifer*) in the Geographic guide. Legs and feet, dark (apparently black). Undertail, rufous, with blackish patches spanning the entire terminus on the outer retrices; these blackish patches appeared as contrastive square dark blocks. The views I obtained of the undertail were either at some distance or with the tail angled away from me, and I was not able to confidently confirm the patterning on any but the outer retrices; however, Mitra confirmed that a narrow dark terminal band crossed all the inner retrices. Uppertail, when closed, uniformly cold gray-brown; on close examination a fine rufous streak was visible on part of one of the retrices, but at no point did the closed tail show the rufous highlights which I associate with *crinitus*. In flight, the tail flashed noticeable rufous, but details of patterning on the spread tail were not obtained. Wings, cold gray-brown overall, with dull white edgings on the coverts and tertials. These edgings were broadest on the tertials, and irregular on the secondaries. The tertials showed noticeably broadly squared apices. The secondaries were visibly heavily worn, and the tips of the primaries were also somewhat ragged. Viewed under a scope, there were scant rufous streaks visible on three or four primaries adjacent to the secondaries, but these streaks were barely perceptible. Rest of upperparts, cold gray-brown, becoming paler gray on the side of the head. Eye, dark (black?), with narrow gray eye-ring. No vocalizations were heard at any time.

AGE: Obvious wear on the wing feathers, as well as whitish (not rufous or buff) margins to the wing coverts, indicates that this was an adult *Myiarchus* in at least its second fall (see Pyle et al. 1987). The dark apices on the retrices corroborate this determination.

SPECIES DETERMINATION: The combination of blackish apices to the retrices, entirely black lower mandible, and fleshy mouth lining on an adult *Myiarchus* flycatcher seems to be diagnostic of *cinerascens*. See also Appendix II. Moreover, all observed details appear to be consistent with adult *cinerascens* in fresh contour plumage, and inconsistent with adult *crinitus* on at least the first ten points below.

(1) Bill color. Excellent unobstructed views of the lower mandible of the Jackson Park bird were obtained under a spotting scope, and all observers confirmed that the bill was entirely black to the point of juncture with the chin feathers. Zimmer 1985:206 notes that "Ash-throated, Brown-crested [*M. tyrannulus*], and Dusky-capped [*M. tuberculifer*] typically have entirely black bills. Great Crested shows a pale (fleshy or yellow) base to the lower mandible. Although this mark is diagnostic, it may be difficult to see on some individuals, and is usually lacking on juveniles, which are black-billed." Pyle et al. 1987:46 describes the lower mandible of *crinitus* as "brownish, horn-colored to yellow-orange at base" and (p. 45) treats the color of the lower mandible as a significant character in identifying *cinerascens*.

(2) Undertail pattern. The blackish terminal patches indicate *cinerascens* or Nutting's Flycatcher *M. nuttingi*, and exclude other *Myiarchus*. See Peterson & Chalif 1973, Pyle et al. 1987. Mitra observed the undertail well, and I obtained

clear views of the outer retrices from below; Mandell had no satisfactory views of the undertail.

(3) Mouth-lining color. The pinkish color of the mouth-lining indicates *cinerascens* over *nuttingi*, and excludes *crinitus*. Pyle et al. 1987 cites the color of the mouth lining of *cinerascens* and *tyrannulus* as "flesh-colored," of *crinitus* as "yellow-orange," and of *nuttingi* as "orange-yellow," and treats the color of the mouth lining as a significant character in species determination in this genus. It is worth pointing out that, at the time of observation, I had no knowledge of typical mouth lining color for any species of *Myiarchus*, and that my assessment of the color was thus not biased by any expectations. I was the sole observer of mouth-lining color.

(4) Bill profile. The bill shape and structure in lateral view were much as depicted for *cinerascens* in the Geographic guide, appearing slighter, more sharply pointed, and with straighter contours than in typical *crinitus*. All observers concurred on this assessment.

(5) Overall structure. Mandell remarked that the shape was consistent with *cinerascens* - being less barrel-chested and bull-headed than *crinitus*. See next.

(6) Size. All observers found the bird slimmer and less bulky than typical *crinitus*, thus making it appear to be a smaller bird, although none of the observers commented at the time on actual bill-to-tail length relative to *crinitus* (which species was not available for direct comparison in any case). These observations are consistent with *cinerascens*; see Oberholser 1974, which lists *crinitus* as averaging 25% heavier than *cinerascens* (1.25 oz. vs 1 oz.), but only 3% longer (8.75" vs 8.5").

(7) Degree of molt. Pyle et al. 1987 note that adult *crinitus* undergoes a complete pre-basic molt "Jul-Aug" on the breeding grounds. Following their definition of terms (p. 25), at least 95% of adults throughout the species' range complete 100% of the wing molt in this period. It would thus appear exceptional for adult *crinitus* to show heavily worn wings in Sep. For *cinerascens*, however, they note that adults undergo a complete pre-basic molt "Aug-Oct." Bent 1942:133, regarding *cinerascens*, indicates that the contour plumage is molted before the flight feathers:

> Practically all the June and July adults that I have seen are in much worn plumage; and October birds all seem to be in fresh plumage. This indicates a complete molt during August and September; I have seen one adult, taken September 21, that is in fresh body plumage but is molting both wings and tail.

As noted above, the secondaries and primaries of the Jackson Park bird were obviously worn, although the tertials may have been new. Degree of wear in the tail was not determined. The contour plumage was presumably mostly or entirely new (see paragraph (11) below), as in Bent's 21 Sep individual. In any event, a Sep adult *cinerascens* with fresh body plumage and worn flight feathers is apparently typical, or at least within normal variation, for the species, unlike *crinitus*.

(8) Head pattern. In my original field notes I recorded, "Rest of upperparts, cold gray-brown, becoming paler gray on the side of the head." The few photographs I have found for *cinerascens*, as well as detailed descriptions (as in Oberholser 1974), indicate that the auricular region of *cinerascens* averages grayer than *crinitus*, and continues, in darker tone, the color of the upper breast, whereas in *crinitus* the auricular region is more a continuation of the olive-brown color of the upperparts. The contrast between the species is shown to exaggeration in the paintings in Farrand, ed., 1983:279. This detail of patterning

was called to my attention by Mandell on the evening of the sighting, or on the next day. He questioned that the Jackson Park bird displayed such a face pattern, but my notes from the field provided the necessary confirmation.

(9) Habitat. The bird's choice of perches was somewhat atypical of *crinitus*, and was apparently rather typical of *cinerascens*. The bird remained in the general vicinity of the "Rose Garden" - a now overgrown area enclosed by hurricane fencing (and void of roses for generations now) - which is the single most reliable site to look for *crinitus* on Wooded Island. However, in my experience, *crinitus* frequents the canopy of the taller trees there, usually about 35-40' above ground. Pough 1949:58 summarizes the preferred habitat of *crinitus*: "Leafy tops of taller trees provide concealed lookout perches, and the bird does much of its feeding in the forest canopy." By contrast, the Jackson Park bird remained mostly 15' above ground or lower, and was first sighted flying up from chest-height undergrowth (mostly thistles and burdock). When Mandell and I first relocated it, it was less than 5' above ground, deep amid the lower branches of a broad tree. Murphy 1982:244ff. summarized perch-height for five records of *cinerascens* in the East in late fall and winter (2 Nov-20 Jan), and found most individuals remained within two meters of the ground, and none were found above 20'. Pough 1949:59 remarks that *cinerascens* "...does most of its foraging in low vegetation...."

(10) Foraging behavior. In my field notes I remarked that the bird "...made a few flights to different perches, though was not actually noted flycatching." At the time those notes were drafted, I intended "flycatching" to refer to the practice of sallying out after prey and returning to the same perch, as in the typical fashion of *crinitus* and other flycatchers. That style of flycatching, however, is apparently atypical of *cinerascens*. Pough 1949:59, e.g., refers to a lack of perch-fidelity in *cinerascens*: "...seldom fly-catching from a fixed perch but ranging over a large territory." Bent 1942:134 quotes Grinnell and Storer: "Unlike many of the Flycatcher tribe, the Ash-throat does not often return to the same location after sallying forth to capture an insect, but usually moves on to a new perch...." The Jackson Park bird was viewed at half a dozen or more perches; at each of these it remained for a few moments to several minutes, but was not seen revisiting any of them. It may well be that the flights it made to various perches were in fact feeding flights - that the bird was flycatching in that sense. Regardless, the absence of fixed-perch flycatching behavior was deemed noteworthy in the field and provides a significant "negative datum" for the species identification, further reinforced by the bird's failure to revisit any previous perches.

I have a vague memory that the bird engaged in activity suggestive of foliage-gleaning at one of its perches. Regarding *cinerascens*, Oberholser 1974:546 remarks, "Most prey is taken on the wing, but the bird will readily pluck a sedentary insect off a leaf...." Bent 1942:133 provides similar observations. By contrast, Bent 1942:115-117 offers a detailed summary of feeding habits for *crinitus* and makes no mention of foliage-gleaning, suggesting that such activity was, at least in Bent's time, unreported for that species. If there is any species-specific significance to foliage-gleaning, it is only indirectly relevant to our bird, however, since such behavior was not adequately recorded.

(11) Color/pattern of underparts. The plumage below was more washed-out than in any typical *crinitus*, yet brighter than "field-guide" *cinerascens*, and with a stonger demarcation between the gray breast and yellow belly. Mitra examined skins of both *cinerascens* and *crinitus* on 7 Sep at Chicago's Field Museum of Natural History and concluded that the Jackson Park bird approximated bright *cinerascens* more than dull *crinitus*. Unfortunately, the Field Museum's collection provides almost no examples of *cinerascens* in fresh fall plumage, nor

have I found illustrations of freshly molted *cinerascens*. However, several sources go to some length to emphasize the brightness of *Myiarchus* in fresh plumage. Roberson 1980:267, e.g., remarks, "...it must be remembered that a fall Ash-throated is in fresh plumage and appears brighter and more yellow-bellied than it has looked all summer." Similarly, Zimmer 1985:206, regarding the genus as a whole, states, "...fall adults...are usually brighter yellow on the belly and darker gray on the throat and breast." He adds (p. 206), "...Ash-throated is the palest below, being very light gray (often whitish) on the throat and breast, and pale yellow on the belly and vent. (Remember, however, that birds in fresh basic plumage are brighter);" and further cautions, "In Ash-throated...the demarcation of gray and yellow is much less pronounced. Once again, it is important to note that fresh fall adults will be darker and brighter below, whereas juveniles will be paler and duller." It may be the case that some *crinitus* in first fall plumage are nearly as dull below as the Jackson Park individual, but that bird was in at least its second fall, and its relative brightness seems in keeping with described plumages of freshly molted adult *cinerascens*, and duller than typical of even worn adults of *crinitus*. Mandell, who had limited previous field experience with *cinerascens*, thought the underparts too highly colored for that species, with too sharp a contrast between the breast and belly, while Mitra and I (based on subsequent research) did not find this a valid objection for freshly molted individuals.

(12) Color of upperparts. The color ascribed to the upperparts in the field was "cold gray-brown." This description is comparable to that of *cinerascens* in several sources. Pyle et al. 1987 describe the upperparts of *cinerascens* as grayish-brown, those of *crinitus* as olive; the National Geographic guide provides like descriptions. Peterson & Chalif 1973 compare both species to *tyrannulus*, and considers *cinerascens* grayer and less olive above, *crinitus* more greenish. Pough 1949 describes the back of *cinerascens* as "clear gray-brown with a little trace of olive" and implies a contrast with the back color of *crinitus*. Zimmer 1985:208 treats color contrasts of the upperparts in this genus as quite subtle, but notes that *cinerascens* is slightly more brownish above, and *crinitus* is more olive.

(13) Amount of rufous in tail. Mandell considered the amount of rufous visible in the spread tail in flight to be more than typical of *cinerascens*, while Mitra and I consistently found the amount of rufous to be significantly less than typical of *crinitus*. Indeed, a lack of apparent rufous in the tail of the flying bird was a factor in my initial assessment of the bird as "not a Great Crested." No still observations of the spread tail were obtained by any observer.

(14) Bill width. Seen from below, Mandell thought the bill broader at the base than shown for *cinerascens* in the Geographic guide. This was a subtle judgment, however, and studying the bill under a telescope in Mandell's company I confided that I was not able to make much of this observation. Pyle et al. reports substantial variation as well as measured overlap in the width of the bills for the species in question (5.0-6.5 mm. for *cinerascens*, 6.4-7.4 mm. for *crinitus*).

(15) Food. The only observed food of the Jackson Park bird was a berry of some sort, which it plucked while perched. Both *crinitus* and *cinerascens* are largely insectivorous; vegetable matter taken by both species seems to consist exclusively of fruits (Bent 1942). For *cinerascens*, Bent reports fruit in 9 out of 80 stomachs of *cinerascens*, amounting to 8% of food taken overall; one stomach contained 44% elderberries. For *crinitus*, Bent reports a slightly lower percentage of fruit consumption (6.30%), based on 265 stomachs. I do not find an explicit statement regarding whether *crinitus* or *cinerascens* typically takes fruit on the wing or from a perch; I suppose the latter method is usual for both

species. Fruit consumption cannot be taken as significantly suggestive of one species over the other.

(16) Date of occurrence. See Appendix I.

The description of the Jackson Park bird was written down in its current form on the day of observation, based on details tape-recorded or put to memory while the bird was in view. Observations and opinions of the other observers were mostly recorded that day or the next. By the evening of 7 Sep, following examination of skins at the Field Museum, Mitra and I found no reason to qualify our initial identification, and subsequent research consistently reinforced that identification. I last discussed the bird with Mandell on, I believe, the evening of 5 Sep. Although Mandell considered the bird at that time to be a probable *M. crinitus* (because of, above all else, the color and patterning of the underparts), or otherwise an unidentifiable *Myiarchus*, Mitra and I found that a diagnosis as *crinitus* is untenable, and that sufficient detail was observed to secure a diagnosis as *cinerascens*, and apparently a typical fall adult *cinerascens*. Indeed, I remarked in the field that the identification was simpler than what I would have expected for such a difficult species. In the interest of objectivity, all the queries raised by Mandell are addressed above.

The point-by-point discussion of details was reworked, and the literature re-reviewed, in Dec 94, at which time the Appendices were added and an essentially final draft of this documentation was prepared. This version was read and approved by Mitra in early Jan 95.

Paul R. Clyne / [redacted]

APPENDIX I

Summary of post-1980 records of vagrant *M. cinerascens*

Murphy 1982 summarized occurrences of *cinerascens* east of the Mississippi. His data show peak numbers in late Nov and early Dec. His earliest record is from 15 Sep, making the Jackson Park bird stand out as remarkably early. I therefore made a perusal of post-1980 fall records (Aug-Nov) of *cinerascens* as reported in *American Birds*.[2] In addition to surveying eastern records, I checked for noteworthy western occurrences. A total of 83 records were tallied, of which 37 are from east of the Mississippi.

The eastern records continue the trend of seasonal distribution described in Murphy 1982, with the monthly breakdown as follows: Sep, five records (including one hypothetical); Oct, eight records (one hypothetical); and Nov, 24 records (five hypothetical). The earliest eastern occurrences coincide with the date of the Jackson Park bird, 4 Sep (1981, Cape Hatteras, North Carolina; and 1984, Fort Morgan, Alabama).

West of the Mississippi, 46 records were published as noteworthy. Most involved out-of-range individuals, although several were within the species' normal range but notably late in the season. The 33 or so vagrant records in the West showed a predominance of early fall occurrences, unlike the pattern described for the East: Aug, 12 records (two as early as 2 Aug); Sep, ten records; Oct, three records; and Nov, seven records. The lone Nebraska record was undated.

Of special note are the 23 records from northwestern U.S. and western Canada, from regions where no *Myiarchus* is of regular occurrence. A total of 18 (78%) of these records clustered in Aug and Sep. These data suggest that the pattern of occurrence outlined in Murphy 1982 may be illusory, and that *cinerascens* may occur more often as a vagrant earlier rather than later in fall. Such a hypothesis would be difficult to document anywhere within the normal range of *crinitus*, however.

The Jackson Park record is seen to lie at the extreme early end of this species' recorded vagrancy east of the Mississippi, but in terms of vagrant records overall the date of occurrence is unremarkable.

Post-1980 vagrant records of *cinerascens* are summarized below. Also included here are Aug-Nov records for the East contained in Murphy 1982. The records are organized by monthly date. Records reported as hypothetical are marked "?", and records from areas west of the Mississippi River are marked "←". Some of the comments included in *American Birds* have been summarized after the reference citation. Canadian provinces are indicated with italicized capital letters: *BC* (British Columbia), *NB* (New Brunswick), *NF* (Newfoundland), *NS* (Nova Scotia), *ON* (Ontario), *QU* (Quebec). For county locations, I relied mostly on Bethel, ed., 1949.

DATE	LOCATION	REFERENCE
no date	←NE: Dawes Co.	AB 42.1:99:1st NE record
08.02.85	←WA: Wenatchee, Chelan Co.	AB 40.1:144
08.02-10.01.84	←OR: Portland, Multnomah Co.	AB 39.1:94
08.05.83	←WA: Turnbull N.W.R.	AB 38.2:226: 2nd record for lati-long
08.18-10.?.91	←*BC*: Crescent Beach	AB 46.1:141

[2] I made no attempt to verify the validity of these reports.

08.24-08.31.80	←TX:	Houston, Harris Co.	AB 35.2:203: 1st in Aug for upper coast
08.25.89	←MT:	Missoula, Missoula Co.	AB 44.1:129
08.25-09.08.84	←OR:	Tillamook Bay, Tillamook Co.	AB 39.1:94
08.27.88	←MT:	Fort Peck, ne. MT	AB 43.1:123
08.27.90	←ID:	Deer Flat, Canyon Co.	AB 45.1:130
08.28.86	←WY:	Casper, Natrona Co.	AB 41.1:124
08.29.90	←WY:	Sheridan, Sheridan Co.	AB 45.1:133
08.30-09.22.88	←TX:	Victoria, Victoria Co.	AB 43.1:131
09.01.81	←ID:	Deer Flat N.W.R., Canyon Co.	AB 36.2:200: 1st for that part of Idaho
09.01.81	←ID:	se. of Swan Falls	AB 36.2:200: 1st for that part of Idaho
09.02.88	←CO:	Holly, se. Colorado	AB 43.1:143
09.04.84	AL:	Fort Morgan	AB 39.1:66
09.04-09.07.81	NC:	Cape Hatteras, off Dare Co.	AB 36.2:167
?09.06.81	NJ:	Cape May, Cape May Co.	AB 36.2:161
09.09.85	←WA:	Vantage	AB 40.1:144
09.12.82	←*BC*:	Vancouver	AB 37.2:217
09.13.80	←*BC*:	Vancouver	AB 35.2:218
09.13.86	VA:	Chincoteague N.W.R., Accomac Co.	AB 41.1:71
09.15.60	RI:	Block Island, Newport Co.	Murphy 1982
09.16.84	←TX:	Galveston, Galveston Co.	AB 39.1:76: pair
09.17.71	AL:	Magnolia Springs, Baldwin Co.	Murphy 1982
09.17-09.20.71	ME:	Appledore Island, Isles of Shoals	Murphy 1982
09.21.80	←TX:	Galveston, Galveston Co.	AB 35.2:203: 1st in Sep for upper coast
09.22.91	←CO:	Rocky Mt. Arsenal	AB 46.1:128
09.23.84	←*BC*:	Saanich, Vancouver Island	AB 39.1:94
09.25.76	RI:	Block Island, Newport Co.	Murphy 1982
09.25.90	MS:	Waveland Lagoon, Hancock Co.	AB 45.1:116:2nd MS record
09.28.85	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 40.1:128
10.02.84	←*BC*:	Delta	AB 39.1:94
?10.06.84	CT:	Bethany, New Haven Co.	AB 39.1:28
10.07-10.08.65	AL:	Dauphin Island, Mobile Co.	Murphy 1982
10.10.77	*QU*:	Franquelin	Murphy 1982
10.11-10.31.87	←CA:	various n. sites	AB 42.1:131: 4 records
10.13.81	AL:	Wheeler Ref., nw. Alabama	AB 36.2:187:2nd inland AL record
10.17.86	AL:	Baldwin Co.	AB 41.1:102
10.20.75	FL:	Gulf Breeze, Santa Rosa Co.	Murphy 1982
10.21.56	FL:	Fair Point, near Pensacola, nw. FL	Murphy 1982
10.21.84	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 39.1:66
10.22.82	←TX:	Sabine Pass, Jefferson Co.	AB 37.2:200: further east than usual
10.24.64	AL:	Bon Secour, Baldwin Co.	Murphy 1982
10.24.92	NY:	Brooklyn, Kings Co.	AB 47.1:73
10.24-10.31.87	NJ:	Sandy Hook, Monmouth Co.	AB 42.1:51
10.25.84	←CA:	Lanphere Dunes	AB 39.1:98
10.27.74	AL:	Fort Morgan	Murphy 1982
10.29.82	*ON*:	Cranberry Marsh, Whitby	AB 37.2:176:1st photo record for *ON*

10.30.93	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 48.1:119
10.31.80	←*BC*:	Iona Island	AB 35.2:218
10.31.85	FL:	Gulf Breeze, Santa Rosa Co.	AB 40.1:128
10.31.87	NJ:	Forsythe N.W.R.	AB 42.1:51
?11.01.84	ME:	Deer Island, Hancock Co.	AB 39.1:28
11.01.86	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 41.1:102: 2 birds
11.01.86	←TX:	High Island	AB 41.1:115
11.02-11.09.73	IL:	Springfield, Sangamon Co.	Murphy 1982
11.02-11.07.93	NY:	Long Island	AB 48.1:94
11.02.58	AL:	Dauphin Island, Mobile Co.	Murphy 1982
11.02.85	←NM:	Owens' Farm	AB 40.1:153: late date
11.03.90	←MN:	Randall	AB 45.1:107:1st MN record
11.04.91	ME:	Somerville[3]	AB 46.1:65:3rd ME record
?11.05.88	MS:	Hancock Co.	AB 43.1:119
11.05.89	MA:	Martha's Vineyard, Dukes Co.	AB 44.1:58
11.07.82	*ON*:	Prince Edward Point	AB 37.2:176
11.07-11.14.93	MA:	Arlington, Middlesex Co.	AB 48.1:89
11.08.85	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 40.1:128
11.09.92	NJ:	Cape May, Cape May Co.	AB 47.1:73
11.09-11.10.92	←*BC*:	Alaksen	AB 47.1:138
11.10.80	MA:	Wellesley, Norfolk Co.	Murphy 1982
?11.10.86	NY:	Battery Park, N.Y.C.	AB 41.1:66
11.10.89	AL:	Fort Morgan	AB 44.1:107
11.11.89	NJ:	Cape May, Cape May Co.	AB 44.1:65
11.11.90	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 45.1:116
11.12-11.30.79	RI:	East Providence, Providence Co.	Murphy 1982
11.14.82	*NS*:	Brier Island	AB 37.2:157
11.14.82	←LA:	Cameron Parish	AB 37.2:191: 2 birds
11.14-12.01.92	*NB*:	Alma	AB 47.1:58
11.15.86	FL:	Fort Pickens, nw. FL	AB 41.1:102
11.mid.82	←OR:	Astoria, Clatsop Co.	AB 37.2:217
11.mid.91	MA:	Wellfleet, Barnstable Co.	AB 46.1:65:6th MA record
11.17-11.19.89	NJ:	Cape May, Cape May Co.	AB 44.1:65
11.18.90	FL:	Fort Pickens, nw. FL	AB 45.1:116
11.18.92	FL:	Paynes Prairie S. Pr.	AB 47.1:85
11.18.93	NY:	Wave Hill, N.Y.C., New York Co.	AB 48.1:94
11.20.88	←CA:	Farallon Island, San Francisco Co.	AB 43.1:164:latest for site
11.21.75	ME:	Bar Harbor, Hancock Co.	Murphy 1982
11.21.84	NY:	Jones Beach, Long Island	AB 39.1:34
11.22.75	MA:	Orleans, Barnstable Co.	Murphy 1982
?11.22.89	PA:	Toughkenamon, Chester Co.	AB 44.1:65
11.22-11.24.70	NY:	Larchmont, Westchester Co.	Murphy 1982
11.22-11.26.57	MD:	Monkton	Murphy 1982
11.24.62	*ON*:	Point Pelee	Murphy 1982

---

[3] This is the site as printed in *American Birds*, but I suspect it is a *lapsus calami* for "Somesville" (Mount Desert Island).

11.24.85	NJ:	Cape May, Cape May Co.	AB 40.1:89f: 2nd confirmed NJ record
11.25.11	MD:	Beltsville, Prince Georges Co.	Murphy 1982
11.25.92	←OR:	Lane Co.	AB 47.1:142
11.25-12.03.72	MA	Gloucester, Essex Co.	Murphy 1982
?11.26.84	*NF*:	St. John's	AB 39.1:28
11.28.92	NJ:	Cape May, Cape May Co.	AB 47.1:73
11.30.86	←TX:	Harris Co.	AB 41.1:115

I had noted in the introductory paragraph that eastern records of *cinerascens* were almost entirely confined to coastal states, but an even stronger statement may be made; viz., that eastern occurrences are almost entirely confined to coastal *counties*, and typically from sites immediately on the Atlantic seaboard or Gulf of Mexico. Of the 59 fall records east of the Mississippi, all come from coastal or effectively coastal counties, with seven exceptions - four of which are from areas immediately on the Great Lakes (the Jackson Park record, plus the three Ontario records). The only three truly inland fall records I know of are those from Springfield, Illinois, from Wheeling Refuge, Alabama, and from Paynes Prairie State Preserve, Florida.

APPENDIX II

Elimination of extra-limital *Myiarchus* flycatchers

Monroe & Sibley 1993:152 list 22 species in *Myiarchus*. In addition to *cinerascens*, the species *crinitus*, *tyrannulus*, and *tuberculifer* are treated in North American guides.

The remaining species show either a pale-based lower mandible, a non-flesh-colored mouth lining, and/or absence of dark terminal patches on the undertail. Several species lack significant rufous in the tail, which is treated here as the simplest means of elimination; this trait is always correlated with absence of dark terminal patches on the undertail.

Peterson & Chalif 1973 discuss *M. nuttingi* and *yucatanensis*. The former is visually very close to *cinerascens*, separable primarily by its orange mouth lining, secondarily by more restricted blackish apices to the tail feathers. The latter has only traces of rufous in the tail, and an orange mouth lining.

Ridgely & Tudor 1994 treat eight additional species occurring in South America. *M. semirufus*, in addition to its lack of a blackish tail band, shows unique cinnamon-rufous underparts, while *swainsoni*, *ferox*, *venezuelensis*, *panamensis*, *phaeocephalus*, *cephalotes*, and *apicalis* show dusky to blackish undertails, without rufous.

M. magnirostris is a Galapagos endemic with a pale-based bill and uniformly dull rufous undertail (Ridgway 1897, and see plate in Steadman & Zousmer 1988).

The remaining seven species occur in the Caribbean. *M. barbirostris* lacks rufous in the tail (Bond 1980), as does *M. antillarum* (Raffaele 1989). *M. sagrae* lacks the dark tail-band of *cinerascens*, but is better separated by appearance of the underparts (Smith & Evered 1992; note that "*M. stolidus*" of Brudenell-Bruce 1975 and of Bond 1980 applies here (="*M. stolidus sagrae*")). *M. nugator* shows a bright orange mouth lining, while in *M. oberi* this is yellow (Evans 1990). The larger *M. validus* shows, among other details, a pale-based bill (see Eckelberry's plate in Bond 1980). *M. stolidus* apparently does not show dark terminal patches on the tail feathers (Wetmore & Swales 1931, de Dod 1978).

REFERENCES

Bent, A.C. 1942 [1963 reprint]. *Life Histories of North American Flycatchers, Larks, Swallows, and Their Allies*. New York: Dover.

Bethel, J.P., ed. 1949. *Webster's Geographical Dictionary*. Springfield, Mass.: G. & C. Merriam Co.

Bohlen, H.D. 1989. *The Birds of Illinois*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Bond, J. 1980. *Birds of the West Indies*, 4th ed. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Brudenell-Bruce, P.G.C. 1975. *The Birds of New Providence and the Bahama Islands*. London: Collins.

de Dod, A.S. 1978. *Aves de la República Dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Museo Nacional de Historia Natural.

Evans, P. 1990. *Birds of the Eastern Caribbean*. London: Macmillan Press.

Farrand, J., Jr., ed. 1983. *The Audubon Society Master Guide to Birding*, Vol. 2: Gulls to Dippers. New York: Alfred A. Knopf.

Monroe, B.L., Jr. & C.G. Sibley. 1993. *A World Checklist of Birds*. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press.

Murphy, W.L. 1982. "The Ash-throated Flycatcher in the East: an overview." In: *American Birds* 36.3:241-247.

National Geographic Society. 1987. *Field Guide to the Birds of North America*, 2nd ed. Washington, D.C.: National Geographic Society.

Oberholser, H.C. 1974. *The Bird Life of Texas*, Vol. 2. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Peterson, R.T. and E.L. Chalif. 1973. *A Field Guide to Mexican Birds*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Pough, R.H. 1949. *Audubon Bird Guide: Small Land Birds of Eastern & Central North America*.... Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday.

Pyle, P., S.N.G. Howell, R.P. Yunick, D.F. DeSante. 1987. *Identification Guide to North American Passerines*. Bolinas, Calif.: Slate Creek Press.

Raffaele, H.A. 1989. *A Guide to the Birds of Puerto Rico and the Virgin Islands*, rev. ed. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Ridgely, R.S. & G. Tudor. 1994. *The Birds of South America*, Vol. II. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Ridgway, R. 1897. "Birds of the Galapagos Archipelago." In: *Proceedings of the Unites States National Museum*, Vol. XIX, No. 1116: 459-670.

Roberson, D. 1980. *Rare Birds of the West Coast*. Pacific Grove, Calif.: Woodcock Publications.

Smith, P.W. & D.S. Evered. 1992. "Photo Note: La Sagra's Flycatcher." In: *Birding*, Vol. XXIV.5: 294-297.

Steadman, D.W. & S. Zousmer. 1988. *Galápagos: Discovery on Darwin's Islands*. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press.

Times Atlas of the World, comprehensive edition, 6th ed. 1980. London: Times Books.

Wetmore, A. & B.H. Swales. 1931. *The Birds of Haiti and the Dominican Republic*. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution.

Zimmer, K.J. 1985. *The Western Bird Watcher*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall.